

EUROPEAN COMMISSION

> Brussels, 27.9.2023 SWD(2023) 574 final

### COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT

DESI 2023 methodological note

Accompanying the document

Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions

Report on the state of the Digital Decade 2023

{COM(2023) 570 final} - {SWD(2023) 570 final} - {SWD(2023) 571 final} - {SWD(2023) 572 final} - {SWD(2023) 573 final}

## Table of Contents

| 1 | The new | DESI 2023                            | 3    |
|---|---------|--------------------------------------|------|
|   | 1.1.1   | Digital skills                       | 5    |
|   | 1.1.2   | Digital infrastructures              | 7    |
|   | 1.1.3   | Digital transformation of businesses |      |
|   | 1.1.4   | Digitalisation of public services    | . 10 |
|   | 1.1.5   | Data sources                         | . 12 |
|   | 1.1.6   | Data flags                           | 12   |
| 1 | .2 Met  | hodological considerations           | 12   |
|   | 1.2.1   | Indicator requirements               | . 12 |
|   | 1.2.2   | Data updates and corrections         | . 12 |

# Table of Tables

| Table 1 DESI 2023 dashboard                             | 4  |
|---|----|
| Table 2 Digital skills indicators                       | 6  |
| Table 3 Digital infrastructures indicators              | 8  |
| Table 4 Digital transformation of businesses indicators | 10 |
| Table 5 Digitalisation of public services indicators    | 11 |
| Table 6 Data sources                                    | 13 |

# 1 The new DESI 2023

The Decision establishing the Digital Decade Policy Programme 2030 (the Decision), adopted by the Council and the Parliament in December 2022<sup>1</sup>, assigns DESI a new and important role for monitoring the progress made by the EU in the context of the Digital Decade. According to the Decision, "DESI should be integrated into the report on the state of the Digital Decade (the 'Report on the Digital Decade'), and should be used to monitor progress towards the digital targets" (the Decision, Recital 24). DESI is defined as "an annual set of analyses and measurement indicators on the basis of which the Commission monitors the Union's and the Member States' overall digital performance across several policy dimensions, including their progress towards the digital targets set out in Article 4" (the Decision, Art. 2(1)).

The implementation of the DDPP is causing a transition from a strategy primarily centered on assessing a country's comparative performance each year in pursuit of identifying the best practices, to an approach that evaluates the combined countries' effort aimed at closing the gap towards achieving the 2030 Digital Decade targets and general objectives. In this common project, each country should contribute to the best of its abilities, taking into account "different potential, and the different starting points, of individual Member States", and its contribution should be "reflected in the national projected trajectories" (the Decision, recital 30).

To implement the Digital Decade Policy Programme, Member States should prepare and submit to the Commission their national strategic roadmaps covering the period up to 2030 including, where possible and measurable at national level, national projected trajectories and all the instruments planned, adopted or implemented to contribute to the achievement of the targets and objectives of the Decision. The national projected trajectories are the key element of the common programme helping to assess the progress over time at the Union and national level.

With the establishment of the trajectories, the Decision introduces the need of assessing progress over time at the Union and national level, with particular emphasis on the progress estimated until 2030.

In line with Art. 2(1), DESI 2023 is based on a set of indicators providing a multi-dimensional, detailed picture of the collective, annual progress made by the EU towards the 2030 goals.

Therefore, the DESI 2023 consists of a dashboard of indicators that have been further aligned with the digital targets set out in the Decision and, for each digital target, all the key performance indicators (KPIs) set out in the Commission Implementing Decision<sup>2</sup>, for which national level values are available, are included.

DESI 2023 includes relevant indicators providing a comprehensive assessment of the level of the country's digital performance. In absence of national level roadmaps and trajectories, DESI 2023 can be seen as setting the scene for the next years of cooperation between the Commission and Member States towards the digital transformation of the Union.

The DESI 2023 indicators dashboard includes a total of 32 indicators, eleven of which are Digital Decade KPIs (Table 1). To allow for a clear connection between indicators and associated targets, indicators are grouped into *dimensions*, related to the Digital Decade targets, and *sub-dimensions*, populated by KPIs and auxiliary related indicators.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Decision (EU) 2022/2481 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 14 December 2022 establishing the Digital Decade Policy Programme 2030 (Text with EEA relevance), OJ L 323, 19.12.2022, p. 4–26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Commission Implementing Decision (EU) 2023/1353 of 30 June 2023 setting out key performance indicators to measure the progress towards the digital targets established by Article 4(1) of Decision (EU) 2022/2481 of the European Parliament and of the Council.

Methodological note

Most of the indicators are collected by the relevant authorities of the Member States and by the Commission (Directorate-General for Communications Networks, Content and Technology and Eurostat) and, in few cases, by ad hoc studies launched by the Commission.

| Table | 1 | DESI | 2023 | dashboard |
|-------|---|------|------|-----------|
|-------|---|------|------|-----------|

| Dimension                       | Sub-dimension                          | Indicator   |
|---------------------------------|--|---|
| 1 Digital skills                | 1a Internet user skills                | 1a1 Internet use  |
|                                 |  | 1a2 At least basic digital skills                         |
|                                 |  | 1a3 Above basic digital skills                            |
|                                 |  | 1a4 At least basic digital content creation skills        |
|                                 |  | 1a5 Enterprises providing ICT training                    |
|                                 | 1b Advanced skills and                 | 1b1 ICT specialists                                       |
|                                 | development                            | 1b2 ICT graduates   |
| 2 Digital                       | 2a Fixed broadband                     | 2a1 At least 100 Mbps broadband take-up                   |
| infrastructures                 |  | 2a2 At least 1 Gbps broadband take-up                     |
|                                 |  | 2a3 Fixed Very High Capacity Network (VHCN) coverage      |
|                                 |  | 2a4 Fibre to the Premises (FTTP) coverage                 |
|                                 | 2b Mobile broadband                    | 2b1 Mobile broadband take-up                              |
|                                 |  | 2b2 Overall 5G coverage                                   |
|                                 |  | 2b3 5G spectrum   |
| 3 Digital                       | 3a Digital intensity                   | 3a1 SMEs with at least a basic level of digital intensity |
| transformation of<br>businesses | 3b Digital technologies for businesses | 3b1 Electronic information sharing                        |
| Dusinesses                      |  | 3b2 Social media  |
|                                 |  | 3b3 Big data  |
|                                 |  | 3b4 Cloud   |
|                                 |  | 3b5 AI  |
|                                 |  | 3b6 e-Invoices  |
|                                 | 3b e-Commerce                          | 3c1 SMEs selling online                                   |
|                                 |  | 3c2 e-Commerce turnover                                   |
|                                 |  | 3c3 Selling online cross-border                           |
| 4 Digitalisation of             | 4a e-Government                        | 4a1 e-Government users <sup>3</sup>                       |
| public services                 |  | 4a2 Digital public services for citizens                  |
|                                 |  | 4a3 Digital public services for businesses                |
|                                 |  | 4a4 Pre-filled forms                                      |
|                                 |  | 4a5 Transparency of service delivery, design and personal |
|                                 |  | data<br>4a6 User support                                  |
|                                 |  | 4a0 Oser support<br>4a7 Mobile friendliness               |
|                                 | 4b e-Health                            | 417 Nobile menumess<br>4b1 Access to e-health records     |
|                                 |  | ANT ACCESS IN G-HEGITI LECOLOS                            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The eGoverment users indicator included in DESI 2023 is defined as "Internet use: website or app of public authorities (last 12 months)". It replaces the previous one that included website of public authorities only and was discontinued by Eurostat.

#### Table 2 Digital skills indicators

| Indicator  | Description  | Unit                     | Source  | Reference year<br>(latest available<br>year with<br>comparable<br>values across<br>the EU) |
|--|--|--------------------------|---|--|
| 1a1 Internet use   | Individuals who use the internet at least once a week  | % individuals            | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT<br>in Households and by individuals (ISOC_CI_IFP_FU<br>[I_IUSE])                   | 2022   |
| 1a2 At least basic<br>digital skills                     | Individuals with 'basic' or 'above basic' digital skills<br>in each of the following five dimensions:<br>information, and data literacy, communication and<br>collaboration, problem solving, digital content<br>creation and safety | % individuals            | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT<br>in Households and by Individuals<br>(ISOC_SK_DSKL_I21 [I_DSK2_BAB])             | 2021   |
| 1a3 Above basic<br>digital skills                        | Individuals with 'above basic' digital skills in each<br>of the following five dimensions: information, and<br>data literacy, communication and collaboration,<br>problem solving, digital content creation and<br>safety            | % individuals            | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT<br>in Households and by Individuals<br>(ISOC_SK_DSKL_I21 [I_DSK2_AB])              | 2021   |
| 1a4 At least basic<br>digital content<br>creation skills | Individuals with at a basic level of skills in using software for digital content creation   | % individuals            | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT<br>in Households and by Individuals<br>(ISOC_SK_DSKL_I21 [I_DSK2_DCC_BAB])         | 2021   |
| 1a5 Enterprises<br>providing ICT<br>training             | Enterprises who provided training in ICT to their personnel  | % enterprises            | Eurostat – European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>eCommerce in Enterprises (ISOC_SKE_ITTN2<br>[E_ITT2])                            | 2022   |
| 1b1 ICT specialists                                      | Employed ICT specialists. Broad definition based<br>on the ISCO-08 classification and including jobs like<br>ICT service managers, ICT professionals, ICT<br>technicians, ICT installers and servicers.                              | % of total<br>employment | Eurostat – Labour force survey (isoc_sks_itspt)   | 2022   |
| 1b2 ICT graduates  | Persons with a degree in ICT   | % graduates              | Eurostat (table educ_uoe_grad03, using selection<br>[ISCED11=ED5-8] and [ISCEDF_13=F06 Information<br>and Communication Technologies] | 2021   |

The digital skills group of indicators assesses both internet user skills of citizens and the number of specialists with advanced digital skills. At least basic digital skills and ICT specialists measure targets of the Digital Decade Policy Programme.

### 1.1.2 Digital infrastructures

#### Table 3 Digital infrastructures indicators<sup>4</sup>

| Indicator           | Description                                       | Unit          | Source  | Reference year<br>(latest available<br>year with<br>comparable<br>values across<br>the EU) |
|---------------------|---|---------------|---|--|
| 2a1 At least 100    | % of households subscribing to fixed broadband    | % households  | European Commission through the Communications      | 2022   |
| Mbps broadband      | of at least 100 Mbps, calculated as overall       |               | Committee (COCOM) and Eurostat – European           |  |
| take-up             | broadband take-up multiplied with the             |               | Union survey on the use of ICT in households and by |  |
|                     | percentage of fixed broadband lines of at least   |               | individuals   |  |
|                     | 100 Mbps (source: COCOM)                          |               |   |  |
| 2a2 At least 1 Gbps | % of households subscribing to fixed broadband    | % households  | European Commission through the Communications      | 2022   |
| broadband take-up   | of at least 1 Gbps, calculated as overall         |               | Committee (COCOM) and Eurostat – European           |  |
|                     | broadband take-up multiplied with the             |               | Union survey on the use of ICT in households and by |  |
|                     | percentage of fixed broadband lines of at least 1 |               | individuals   |  |
|                     | Gbps (source: COCOM)                              |               |   |  |
| 2a3 Fixed Very      | % of households covered by any fixed VHCN. The    | % households  | Broadband coverage in Europe studies for the        | 2022   |
| High Capacity       | technologies considered are FTTH and FTTB for     |               | European Commission by Omdia and Point Topic        |  |
| Network (VHCN)      | 2017-2018 and FTTH, FTTB and Cable DOCSIS 3.1     |               |   |  |
| coverage            | for 2019 onwards (source: EUROSTAT ISOC_CBT)      |               |   |  |
| 2a4 Fibre to the    | % of households covered by FTTH and FTTB          | % households  | Broadband coverage in Europe studies for the        | 2022   |
| Premises (FTTP)     | (source: EUROSTAT ISOC_CBT)                       |               | European Commission by Omdia and Point Topic        |  |
| coverage            |   |               |   |  |
| 2b1 Mobile          | Individuals who used the internet on a mobile     | % individuals | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT  | 2021   |
| broadband take-up   | device  |               | in households and by individuals (ISOC_CI_DEV_I     |  |
|                     |   |               | [I_IUG_MD])   |  |
| 2b2 Overall 5G      | % of populated areas with coverage by at least    | % populated   | Broadband coverage in Europe studies for the        | 2022   |
| coverage            | one 5G mobile network (source: EUROSTAT           | areas         | European Commission by Omdia and Point Topic        |  |
|                     | ISOC_CBT)   |               |   |  |
| 2b3 5G spectrum     | The amount of spectrum assigned and ready for     | Assigned      | European Commission services, through the           | 2023   |
|                     | 5G use within the so-called 5G pioneer bands.     | spectrum as a | Communications Committee (COCOM)                    |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Please note that indicator's values from both COCOM and Omdia/Point Topic can be slightly revised backwards at the request of the MS's National Regulatory Authorities. For this reason, time series included in previous versions of the DESI may not fully match with the ones reported in DESI 2023.



| These bands are 700 MHz (703-733 MHz and               | % of total    |  |
|--|---------------|--|
| 758-788 MHz), 3.6 GHz (3400-3800 MHz) and 26           | harmonised 5G |  |
| GHz (1000 MHz within 24250-27500 MHz). All             | spectrum      |  |
| three spectrum bands have an equal weight <sup>5</sup> |               |  |

Under this group of indicators, both fixed and mobile broadband are analysed with indicators measuring the supply and the demand side. Fixed VHCN and 5G coverage measure targets of the Digital Decade Policy Programme.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Data on 5G spectrum are not published by Eurostat.

### 1.1.3 Digital transformation of businesses

#### Table 4 Digital transformation of businesses indicators

| Indicator   | Description   | Unit          | Source   | Reference year<br>(latest<br>available year<br>with<br>comparable<br>values across<br>the EU) |
|---|---|---------------|--|---|
| 3a1 SMEs with at<br>least a basic level<br>of digital intensity | The digital intensity score is based on counting<br>how many out of 12 selected technologies are<br>used by enterprises. A basic level requires usage<br>of at least 4 technologies.  | % SMEs        | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC_E_DII [E_DI4_LO +<br>E_DI4_HI + E_DI4_VHI]) | 2022  |
| 3b1 Electronic<br>information<br>sharing                        | Enterprises who have in use an ERP (enterprise<br>resource planning) software package to share<br>information between different functional areas<br>(e.g. accounting, planning, production,<br>marketing)   | % enterprises | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC_EB_IIPN2<br>[E_ERP1])                       | 2021  |
| 3b2 Social media  | Enterprises using two or more of the following<br>social media: social networks, enterprise's blog<br>or microblog, multimedia content sharing<br>websites, wiki-based knowledge sharing tools.<br>Using social media means that the enterprise has<br>a user profile, an account or a user license<br>depending on the requirements and the type of<br>the social media. | % enterprises | Eurostat – European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC_CISMT<br>[E_SM1_GE2])                       | 2021  |
| 3b3 Big data  | Enterprises analysing big data from any data source   | % enterprises | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC EB BD [E BDA])                              | 2020  |
| 3b4 Cloud   | Enterprises buying sophisticated or intermediate cloud computing services   | % enterprises | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in enterprises (ISOC_CICCE_USE<br>[E_CC1_SI])                    | 2021  |
| 3b5 AI  | Enterprises using any AI technology   | % enterprises | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in enterprises (ISOC_EB_AI<br>[E_AI_TANY])                       | 2021  |

| 3b6 e-Invoices                     | Enterprises sending e-invoices, suitable for automated processing         | % enterprises     | Eurostat - European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC_EB_ICSN2<br>[E_INV4S_AP]) | 2020 |
|------------------------------------|---|-------------------|--|------|
| 3c1 SMEs selling online            | SMEs selling online (at least 1% of turnover) <sup>6</sup>                | % SMEs            | Eurostat – European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises (ISOC_EC_ESELS<br>[E_ESELL])    | 2022 |
| 3c2 e-Commerce<br>turnover         | SMEs' total turnover from e-commerce <sup>7</sup>                         | % SME<br>turnover | Eurostat – European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises<br>(ISOC_EC_EVALS[E_ETURN])     | 2022 |
| 3c3 Selling online<br>cross-border | SMEs that carried out electronic sales to other EU countries <sup>8</sup> | % SMEs            | Eurostat – European Union survey on ICT usage and<br>e-commerce in Enterprises<br>(ISOC_EC_ESELS[E_AESEU])     | 2021 |

The Digital transformation of businesses group of indicators is made up of 3 sub-groups: digital intensity, take-up of selected technologies by enterprises and ecommerce. SMEs with at least a basic level of digital intensity, take-up of Big data, Cloud and AI are targets of the Digital Decade Policy Programme.

#### 1.1.4 Digitalisation of public services

 Table 5 Digitalisation of public services indicators

| Indicator             | Description  | Unit        | Source <sup>9</sup>                                | Reference year<br>(latest available<br>year with<br>omparable values<br>across the EU) |
|-----------------------|--|-------------|--|--|
| 4a1 e-Government      | Individuals who used the Internet, in the last 12    | % internet  | Eurostat – European Union survey on the use of ICT | 2022   |
| users                 | months, for interaction with public authorities on   | users       | in households and by individuals (ISOC_CIEGI_AC    |  |
|                       | websites or on mobile applications                   |             | [I_IGOVANYS])                                      |  |
| 4a2 Digital public    | The share of administrative steps that can be        | Score (0 to | e-Government Benchmark 2023                        | 2022   |
| services for citizens | done online for major life events (birth of a child, | 100)        |  |  |
|                       | new residence, etc.) for citizens                    |             |  |  |
| 4a3 Digital public    | The indicator broadly reflects the share of public   | Score (0 to | e-Government Benchmark 2023                        | 2022   |
| services for          | services needed for starting a business and          | 100)        |  |  |
| businesses            | conducting regular business operations that are      |             |  |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Data for e-commerce refer to the calendar year prior to the survey, e.g. 2022 data refer to 2021 e-commerce.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Data for e-commerce refer to the calendar year prior to the survey, e.g. 2022 data refer to 2021 e-commerce.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Data for e-commerce refer to the calendar year prior to the survey, e.g. 2021 data refer to 2020 e-commerce.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Eurostat dataset code in brackets with indicator filter in squared brackets.

|   | available online for domestic as well as foreign<br>users. Services provided through a portal receive<br>a higher score, services which provide only<br>information (but have to be completed offline)<br>receive a more limited score.  |                     |  |      |
|---|--|---------------------|--|------|
| 4a4 Pre-filled forms  | Amount of data that is pre-filled in public service<br>online forms  | Score (0 to<br>100) | e-Government Benchmark 2023  | 2022 |
| 4a5 Transparency<br>of service delivery,<br>design and<br>personal data   | The extent to which service processes are<br>transparent, services are designed with user<br>involvement and users can manage their personal<br>data   | Score (0 to<br>100) | e-Government Benchmark 2023  | 2022 |
| 4a6 User support  | The extent to which online support, help features,<br>and feedback mechanisms are available incl.<br>cross-border  | Score (0 to<br>100) | e-Government Benchmark 2023  | 2022 |
| 4a7 Mobile<br>friendliness  | The extent to which services are provided<br>through a mobile friendly interface, an interface<br>that is responsive to the mobile device  | Score (0 to<br>100) | e-Government Benchmark 2023  | 2022 |
| 4b1 Citizens' online<br>access to electronic<br>health records<br>(short name =<br>Access to e-Health<br>records) | Measured as: (i) the nationwide availability of<br>online access services for citizens to their<br>electronic health records data (via a patient<br>portal, or a patient mobile app) with additional<br>measures in place that enable certain categories<br>of people (e.g. guardians for children, people with<br>disabilities, elderly) to also access their data, and<br>(ii) the percentage of individuals that have the<br>ability to obtain or make use of their own<br>minimum set of health-related data currently<br>stored in public and private electronic health-<br>record (EHR) systems. | Score (0 to<br>100) | Service contract for the European Commission by:<br><u>Empirica GmbH and PredictBy</u> | 2022 |

The digitalisation of public services group of indicators describes the demand and supply of e-government as well as e-health. The Digital public services for citizens and businesses and the access to e-health records are indicators assessing targets of the Digital Decade Policy Programme.

#### 1.1.5 Data sources

Most of the data in the DESI 2023 have been collected directly by national authorities, like the National Statistical Institutes coordinated by Eurostat or National Regulatory Authorities. Table 6 presents the data sources and the role of national authorities in data collection and validation.

| Data source   | Data collection process  |
|---|--|
| Eurostat  | Data collected by National Statistical Authorities and verified by the National Statistical Authorities and Eurostat.  |
| Communications Committee (COCOM)                            | Data collected and verified by the national regulatory<br>authorities (by data experts appointed by the members of the<br>Communications Committee in every Member State).   |
| Broadband coverage studies                                  | Data collected by IHS Markit, Omdia and Point Topic and<br>verified by the national regulatory authorities (by data experts<br>appointed by the members of the Communications Committee<br>in every Member State). |
| e-Government benchmark                                      | Data collected by Capgemini and verified by relevant ministries in every Member State.   |
| Study for Digital Decade e-Health Indicators<br>Development | Data collected by Empirica from representatives appointed by the relevant ministries in every Member State.  |

#### Table 6 Data sources

#### 1.1.6 Data flags

A limited number of data points include explanatory notes (data flags), which can be consulted directly on the website of Eurostat at <u>https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/digital-economy-and-society</u>. In particular, there is break in the series for the ICT specialists and Female ICT specialists indicators.

### 1.2 Methodological considerations

#### 1.2.1 Indicator requirements

To be included in the DESI dashboard, indicators shall comply with the following requirements:

- *Must be collected on a regular basis*. In order to fulfil the monitoring function, the indicators used in the dashboard must be collected <u>ideally</u> on a yearly basis (or at least with a pre-defined regularity<sup>10</sup>).
- *Must be relevant for a policy area of interest*. All indicators in the dashboard must be accepted as relevant metrics in their specific policy areas.

#### 1.2.2 Data updates and corrections

Updates and corrections are part of the lifecycle and nature of statistical data especially in the digital sector that is a rapidly moving environment. This is the case of several DESI indicators. There can be several reasons for such restatements. For example, it is typical that the values for one indicator

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> For the data sources mentioned under 1.1.7, annual data collection exercises are foreseen, except some of the data collected and verified by the national statistical offices or by Eurostat which may collected with a lower frequency.

Methodological note

undergo small amendments and only stabilise completely even long after the indicator was originally computed. Member States can also update their own methodology to collect the data for the indicators on which they report, for example to Eurostat, and revise backward the figures. Such revisions may impact country rankings based on individual indicators.

The present report considers updates that were reported to the European Commission prior to May 15, 2023, for all indicators that had updated data or were new with respect to the DESI 2022 edition<sup>11</sup>. Any changes made after this date are not considered in the current version of DESI. For indicators where no new data was provided by the respective data source in 2023, the values published in DESI 2022 are utilized.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> With the only exception on the indicator Access to e-Health records for which a revision has been transmitted in July 2023.